

Love's Labour's Lost and the Harvey-Nashe-Greene Quarrel

by

Eugene J. Kettner*

A well known literary quarrel of the early 1590's touched upon the London theatrical profession and involved Gabriel Harvey (and brother, Richard), Thomas Nashe, and Robert Greene. Ironically enough, Greene was merely the agent who precipitated the Harvey attacks with his remark about the ". . . sons of a ropemaker." Actually, the issue lay between Harvey and Thomas Nashe, and some think that it was Nashe himself who inserted the ropemaker allusion into Greene's *A Quip for an Vpstart Courtier* (1592).¹ Scholars have also probed the question of Shakespeare's possible involvement in this quarrel through *Love's Labour's Lost*, variously dated from 1589 to 1594. Indeed, a knowledge of the literary activities and the personalities of Harvey, Nashe, and Greene, and an assessment of particular scenes in *Love's Labour's Lost* may produce evidence to determine the extent of Shakespeare's acquaintance with the participants in this dispute. For the fullest comprehension of this problem, one proposes, first, to cite parallels in *Love's Labour's Lost* to the works of these three authors; and, secondly, to measure the extent of Shakespeare's possible allusions to any of these individuals concerned with the quarrel. Unless otherwise stated, the 1598 Quarto of *Love's Labour's Lost* is the text which has been used in this study.

Gabriel Harvey

Harvey

Is it not possible for Humanity, to be a spittle-man, Rhetorique a summerell, Poetry a tumbler, History a bankrowt, Philosophy a broker, wit a cripple, courage a jade? ("Pierce's Supererogation," 1593, *Works*, II, 283)

LLL

Make rich the ribbes, but bancrout quite the wits. (I. i. 27)

Although both authors employ the words, *wit* and *bancrout* (*bankrowt*), in a different grammatical sense, the terms, nevertheless, connote a similar paradoxical state. Whereas wits are normally to be nurtured at the expense of the ribs in an academic career, the usual order is for the ribs to be fed and the wits, neglected; hence, the unnaturalness of the *Academe* situation, an imbalance between wits and ribs, enriching the one and bankrupting the other.

*Mr. Kettner is an Instructor in English at the University of Missouri. This study originated as a master's thesis at Kansas State Teachers College, Emporia, under the direction of Professor Charles E. Walton, Department of English.

1. Donald J. McGinn, "A Quip from Tom Nashe," *Studies in the English Renaissance Drama*, pp. 172ff.

Harvey

Either Arte is obscure, or the quickest capacity dull: and needeth Methode, as it were the bright Moone, to illuminate the darksome night: but Practise is the bright Sun, that shineth in the day, & the soueraigne Planet that gouerneth the world: . . . To excell, ther is no Arte to diligent Exercise: but where they must be vnmarried, or diuorced, geue me rather Exercise without Arte, then Arte without Exercise. Perfect vse worketh masteries: and disgraceth vnexperienced Arte. Examples are infinite: and dayly display themselves. A world without a Sunne: a Boddy without a Soule: Nature without Arte: Arte without Exercise: sory creatures. ("Fovre Letters, and Certaine Sonnets," September, 1592, *Works*, I, p. 228)

Harvey analyzes the relationship between *Arte* and *Exercise*, emphasizing the necessity of a balance between the two. In referring to *Practise* in terms of the *Sun*, and to *Study* in terms of the *Moone*, he expresses much the same idea as Shakespeare, who also considers the academic disciplines in terms of the sun. Shakespeare recognizes a potential futility in study ("Light seeking light, doth light of light beguyle"); Harvey also implies this idea when he discusses "Exercise without Arte" and warns of "A world without a Sunne: a Boddy without a Soule." He recommends the marriage of "studious Arte to diligent Exercise," claiming that "Practise is the bright Sun that shineth in the day." Shakespeare also advocates a balance between study and exercise and asserts that "Studie is lyke the heauens glorious Sunne." In both passages, there is also a notable play upon *light* and *dark*, a device which becomes increasingly prominent as *LLL* develops.

Harvey

The grene maister of the Blacke Arte ("Fovre Letters," 1592, *Works*, I, 202)

Oh what a notable matter were here for a greene head (*Ibid.*, 172)

But Greene . . . still flourisheth in the memory of some greene wits (*Ibid.*, 156)

. . . might haue bene tollerated in a greene and wild youth. ("Pierce's Supererogation," 1593, *Works*, II, 96)

LLL

Light seeking light, doth light of light beguyle: / So ere you finde where light in darknes lyes, Your light growes darke by loosing of your eyes . . . / Studie is lyke the heauens glorious Sunne, / That will not be deepe searcht with sawcie lookes: / Small haue continuall plodders euer wonne, / Saue base authoritie from others Bookes. / These earthly God-fathers of heauens lights, / That giue a name to every fixed Starre, / Haue no more profite of their shyning nights, / Then those that walke and wot not what they are. / Too much to know, is to know nought but fame: every God-father can giue a name. (I. i 77-93)

LLL

Greene in deede is the colour of Louers; but to haue a loue of that colour (I.ii.90-91) It was so sir, for she had a greene wit. (I. ii. 94)

This is the lyuer veine, which makes flesh a deitie. / A greene Goose, a Goddess, pure pure ydoltarie. (IV. iii. 73-74)

The Spring is neare when greene geese are a breeding. (I. i. 97)

Greene usually connotes youthfulness. In Shakespeare, the words, *Spring* and *grene*, convey this meaning. Harvey, also, uses *greene* in the sense of youth or inexperience. Partridge suggests that *green* was often used by Shakespeare with ". . . a sexual undercurrent of implication."² (And one should not overlooked the chance of a reference to Robert Greene in these passages.)

Harvey

. . . any whosoeuer will needes be offering abuse in fact, or snip-snapping in termes, sith other shrinketh, he may peraduenture not altogether passe unanswered. ("Pierce's Supererogation," 1593, *Works*, II, 313)

If Nashe will felly gnash, and rudely slash: / Snip-snap a crash, may lend S. Fame a gash. (*Ibid.*, 338)

LLL

Now by the sault wane of the meditaranium, a sweete tutch, a quicke vene we of wit, snip snap, quicke and home, it reioyceth my intellect, true wit. (V. i. 60-64)

. . . keepe not too long in one tune, but a snip and away. (III. i. 21)

In both authors, *snip* and *snap* suggest sharp wit. Harvey also couples the word with *abuse*, implying raillery and scurrility. Halliwell shows that the phrase was used to depict the ". . . cutting of a tailor's shears."³

Harvey

. . . the sonnes of Adam, & the daughters of Eve, haue noe neede of the Serpentes carowse to set them agogg. ("Pierce's Supererogation," 1593, *Works*, II, 92)

"A child of our Grandmother Eue," of course, would be Eve's daughter. In context, both passages emphasize the erotic tendencies of women. Harvey implies that women have need of no temptation; and so does Shakespeare, in the fuller scope of the scene in the play.

LLL

With a child of our Grandmother Eue, a female, or for thy more sweete vnderstanding a Woman (I. i. 266-68)

Harvey

. . . being demaunded his opinion of the Eldership in question; answered, he conceiued of the Eldership . . . as he thought of the Eldertree ("An Aduertisement for Papp-hatchett, and Martin Marprelate," 1589, *Works*, II, 149)

LLL

Begin sir, you are my elder. / Well followed, Iudas was hanged on an Elder. (V. ii. 609-10)

The obvious puns upon *elders*, *elderships*, and *elder trees*—with reference to the Judas story, to age, and to church office—are readily discerned. Shakespeare's lines encompass the Judas proverb as well as the age of man. On the other hand Harvey uses the tree, upon which Judas is thought to have hanged himself, for a discussion of the status of the church.

2. Eric Partridge, *Shakespeare's Bawdy*, p. 123.

3. H. H. Furness (ed.), quoted in *A New Variorum Edition of Shakespeare, Love's Labour's Lost*, p. 220.

Harvey

. . . to imbare the hardy foole in the famous Shipp of Fooles . . . ("An Aduertisement for Papp-hatchett," 1953, *Works*, II, 125)

. . . recommend to the Ship of Fooles (*Loc. cit.*)

LLL

The Ship is vnder sayle, and here she comes amaine. (V. ii. 548)

Shakespeare's allusion is an expansive one. In *LLL*, when the play-within-the-play (called *The Nine Worthies*) is acted by such fools as the Pedant, the Braggart, the Hedge-Priest, the Foole, and the Boy (V.iii. 545-46), he combines the *Ship of Fools* with the *Ship of Wisemen*. Harvey makes a similar distinction: ". . . foole in the Ship of wisemen."

Harvey

She knew what she said, that intituled Pierce, the hoggshead of witt: Penniles, the tospot of eloquence: & Nashe, the verve inuenter of Asses. She it is, that must broach the barrrell of thy striking conceite, and canonize the Patriarke of newe writers. ("Fovre Letters," 1952, *Works*, I, 197)

LLL

Maister Person, quasi Person? And if one shoulde be perst, Which is the one? / Marrie M. Scholemaster, he that is liklest to a hoggshead. / Of persing a Hogshead, a good luster of conceit in a turph of Earth, Fier enough for a Flint, Pearle enough for Swine: tis prettie, it is well. (IV.ii. 84-90)

Because of a similarity in the Elizabethan pronunciation of such words as *parson*, *person*, *pierce*, and *purse*, and for the obvious association of these words with *pennies*, it is possible to think that Shakespeare was acquainted with Harvey's reference to Nashe as expressed in this passage. The further presence of *hoggshead* in both examples strengthens this concept.

Harvey

. . . his vaine glorious and Thrasonical rimester . . . ("Pierce's Supererogation," 1593, *Works*, II, 119)

LLL

. . . his generall behauior vaine, rediculous, & thrasonicall. (V. i. 14-15)

Harvey was especially fond of *thrasonicall*, a word which, as Furness points out, may have appeared earlier in print in the dedication to *Tarleton's Tragical Treatises* (1578).⁴

Harvey

The summe of summe is He tost his imagination a thousand waies, and I beleue searched euey corner of his Grammar-schoole witte (for his margin is as deeplie learned, as *Fauste precor gelida*) to see if he could finde anie means to relieue his estate ("Fovre Letters," 1592, *Works*, I, 195)

LLL

Facile precor gellida, quando pecas omnia sub umbra ruminat, and so forth. (IV. ii. 95-105)

4. *Ibid.*, pp. 208-9.

Nathaniel in *LLL* recites the Latinate grammar school phrase to impress his associates. On the other hand, Harvey uses it to belittle Nashe's learning and wit which, he implies, are no more elevated than that of a grammar school boy's. Actually, Harvey, Shakespeare, and Nashe all use the phrase as an instrument of ridicule. Therefore, it is significant that Shakespeare deliberately misquotes the Mantuan line, to emphasize the stupidity of Nathaniel.⁵

Harvey

. . . a Trifle for the manner: though the matter be . . . super excellent ("New Letter of Notable Contents," 1593, *Works*, I, 269)

It is of little Value, either for *matter*, or *manner*, that can be performed in such perfunctory Pamphlets ("Pierce's Supererogation," 1593, *Works*, II, 318)

LLL

The matter is to me sir, as concerning Iaquenetta: / The manner of it is, I was taken with the manner. / In what manner? / In manner and forme following sir all those three. / (I. i. 204-7)

The frequency with which both Harvey and Shakespeare pun upon the words, *matter* and *manner*, is perhaps explained in Blackstone:

Maynour is when a Theefe hath stolne, and is followed with Hue and Cry, and taken, having that found upon him which he stole, that is called Maynour. And so we use to say when we find one doing an unlawful Act, that we took him with the Maynour or Manner.⁶

In the Shakespeare passage, the extension of these connotations to include "manor house" and "behaviour" is obvious. Harvey, in the case cited, also appears to be alluding to literary style.

Harvey

. . . an Epitome of fantasticalitie ("Fovre Letters," 1592, *Works*, I, 190)

. . . what fantastically panges are these? (*Ibid.*, 217)

. . . his impudent pamphletting, phantastically interluding, and desperate libelling (*Ibid.*, 169)

. . . as fantastically and fond a Dialogue, as I haue seene (*Ibid.*, 160)

LLL

I abhorre such phantastically phantasims, such insociable and poynt deuse companions (V. i. 19-20)

For I protest, the Schoolmaister is exceeding fantastically, Too too vaine, too too vaine (V. ii. 531-32)

As Shakespeare applies *phantasim* to Armado, it describes one who is excessive in actions; more specifically, an arrogant, ostentatious, pedantic individual. Harvey's adjective, *fantastically*, denotes an affected or unnatural mode of speech, perhaps turgid.

5. *Ibid.*, pp. 148-50.

6. Quoted in *ibid.*, p. 35.

Harvey

LLL

. . . Dionisius Areopagita . . . Sweet inuocation of a child, most
is reported in a certain Patheticall pretty & pathological. (I. ii. 102)
Ecstasie to haue cryed out . . .
("A Pleasant and Pitthy Familiar dis-
course, of the Earthquake in April
last," 1580, *Works*, I, 57)

Richard David, in his edition of *LLL*, calls attention to the term, *pathetical*, and states that it was introduced and frequently used by Gabriel Harvey.⁷

Harvey

LLL

Old whimwhams have plodded on, Small haue continuall plodders euer
long enough; fresh inuention from the wonne, / Saue base aucthoritie from
tapp, must haue his friskes & careers others Bookes. (I. i. 86)
an other while . . . ("Pierce's
Supererogation," 1593, *Works*, II, 44)

Shakespeare's use of *plodders* parallels Harvey's concept of *old whimwhams* who have *plodded* on. Indeed, both authors are commenting upon a similar topic. Shakespeare is discussing the lack of literary invention; Harvey is saying that *fresh inuention* must be drawn from the tap to enliven the plodder.

Harvey

LLL

. . . conceiue any high hope of How low so euer the matter, I hope in
low means . . . ("Pierce's Super- God for high words. / A high hope
erogation," 1593, *Works*, II, 84) for a low heauen . . . (I. i.
196-97)

Here, the parallels are obvious. Scholars have debated the correct meaning to be attached to the lines from *LLL*, however, finding a *low heauen* a paradox difficult to explicate. One might suggest that Shakespeare was indulging in playhouse terminology with reference to stage heavens, an area which would have been appreciably lower than real heaven itself.

Thomas Nashe

Nashe

LLL

Thou turmoilest thy *pia mater* to These are begot in the ventricle of
proue base births better than the of- Memorie, nourisht in the wombe of
spring of many discents . . . primater, and deliuered vpon the mel-
("Foure Letters Confuted," 1593, lowing of the occasion . . .
Works, II, 272) (IV. ii. 70-72)

Pia mater for *brain* is used by both authors, Shakespeare allowing Nathaniel to mispronounce it as *primater*. Later in *LLL*, Nathaniel will demonstrate this same skill when corrupting *Fauste precor*. In the *primater* statement, he is alluding to poetical conceits which he considers ". . . foolish extrauagant spirit, full of forms, figures, slopes, objects, Ideas . . ." Nashe is attacking Gabriel Harvey, as usual, and is touching upon other literary matters in their personal feud.

7. Richard David (ed.), *Love's Labour's Lost*, fn. 92, p. 24.

Nashe

With the first and second leafe, hee plaies verie pretilie, and in ordinarie termes of extenuating, veridits *Pierce Pennilesse for Grammar Schoole wit; saies his Margine is as deeplie learned as Fauste precor gelida . . .* ("Foure Letters Confuted," 1593, *Works*, II, 249)

LLL

Facile precor gellida. (IV. ii. 95)

Here, again, Nathaniel mispronounces. At the same time, both Harvey and Nashe use the Latinate phrase in ridicule of one another. David thinks it an expression which even ". . . the worst of Grammar School dunces might be expected to remember," and does not, therefore, believe that Shakespeare would unintentionally have misquoted such a "notorious" line.⁸ Since Nathaniel is a misquoter, Shakespeare has apparently extended him this privilege of misquoting for comic effect.

Nashe

. . . thy offence as heynous as Iudasses. ("Foure Letters Confuted," 1593, *Wrks*, II, 243)

LLL

Therefore as he is, an Asse, let him go: / And so adue sweete Iude. Nay, why dost thou stay? / For the latter ende of his name. / For an Asse to the Iude: giue at him. / Iudas away. (V. ii. 628-31).

The railing terms of *Ass* and *Iudas* were exceedingly popular during the Marprelate controversy. Here, both Shakespeare and Nashe are playing upon combinations. Whether or not this punning may be directly associated with the immediate dispute is debatable; however, the Nashe remark does have a meaning for Harvey, whom he was attacking in *Four Letters Confuted*.

Nashe

. . . the hair shirt will chafe whordome out of their boanes, and the hard lodging on the boards, take their flesh downe a button hole lower. ("Pierce Pennilesse," 1592, *Works*, II, 77)

LLL

Maister, let me take you a button hole lower. (V. ii. 706)

A *button hole lower* implies a degree of less importance. (Harvey uses what may be a variation of the theme in "Take you a peg lower.")

Nashe

. . . all those . . . were mere meacocks & Ciphers in comparison of thy excellent out-cast selfe that liu'dst in Cambridge vnmounted. ("Foure Letters Confuted," 1593, *Works*, II, 245)

LLL

To proue you a Cypher. (I. ii. 59)

Nashe is again villifying Harvey. *Cypher* implies a mere nothing, a no-account. In Shakespeare's text, it is significant that the word occurs in a

8. *Ibid.*, fn. 285, pp. 110-11.

speech by Moth directed against Armado since scholars have thought Moth to be a stage representation of Nashe. Harvey employs the same image in *The Trimming of Thomas Nashe* (1597), replying to *Four Letters Confuted*:

. . . thou art as many Ciphers without an I, which they wanting are of themselves nothing, and thou hast much apparencie of witte which is as Ciphers, but thou hast not this same I: Iota is wanting to thy Ciphers, thou hast not one iot nor title of true witte⁹

All three authors, therefore, are working with the same image in similar sets of circumstances.

Nashe

I haue a tale at my tungs end, if I can happen vpon it, of his hobby-horse-reuelling & dominering at Audley-end, when the Queene was there ("Haue with you to Saffron-walden," 1596, *Works*, III, 106)

LLL

The Hobbie-horse is forgot. / Calst thou my loue Hobbie-horse. / No Maister, the Hobbi-horse is but a colt, and your loue perhaps a hacknie (III. i. 30-32)

By means of the hobby-horse allusion, Nashe suggests that Harvey behaved ridiculously when the Queen visited the neighborhood of Saffron-Walden, and strongly hints at the gaudy hobby-horse character of the morris dance. In Shakespeare's lines, the term designates a coltish quality. Indeed, its juxtaposition to *hacknie* conveys an erotic meaning, suggesting a woman of low character.¹⁰

Nashe

Tapsters this quarter shall be in greater credite than Coblers ("A Wonderful Strange and Miraculous Astrologicall Prognostication," 1591, *Works*, II, 164)

LLL

How many is one thrice told? / I am ill at reckning, it fitteth the spirit of a Tapster. (I. ii. 43-44)

. . . I am no tapster, to say, Anon, anon, sir (*Summer's Last Will and Testament*, 1592, *Works*, VI)

. . . his Tapster ouerhearing him, cried, anone, anone, sir (*The Vnfortunate Traveller*, *Works*, V, 13)

In *LLL*, Armado does not wish to be thought a member of common society. Of course, Nashe is once more attacking Harvey's social status. Furthermore, one recalls Poin's familiar, "Anon, anon, sir," from *I Henry IV*.

Robert Greene

At this point, it is necessary to call attention to Harvey's comprehensive description of Robert Greene:

9. Gabriel Harvey, *The Works of Gabriel Harvey*, III, p. 28.
10. Furness, *op. cit.*, p. 89.

. . . a Wilde head, ful of mad braine and a thousands crotchets: A scholler, a Discourser, a Courtier, a ruffian, a Gamester, a Louer, a Souldier, a traailer, a Merchaunt, a Broker, an Artificer, a Botcher, a pettifogger, a Player, a Coosener, a Raylor, a beggar, an omnigatherum, a Gay nothing: a Storehouse of bald and baggage stuffe, vnwoorth the aunswering, or reading; a Triuiall, and triobular Autor for knaues, & fooles: an Image of Idleness; an Epitome of fantasticalities; a Mirroure of Vanitie¹¹

In *LLL*, Ferdinand describes Armado in much the same language, dubbing him a "refined traailer of Spaine," pointing to him as one with a "mint of phrases in his braine" who likes to hear his "owne vaine tongue." (I. i. 163-77) On the other hand, Greene had published *Spanish Masquerado* in 1598, in which he had used the phrase, *magnificent Monarcho*, by which term he was thereafter identified.¹² Shakespeare makes use of similar terminology in I. i. 193. Furthermore, Armado is presented as a soldier in the court of Ferdinand and is referred to as a Spanish traveller. Harvey, at the same time, describes Greene as a traveller with a ". . . wilde head, full of mad braine and a thousande crotchets," while Shakespeare's Armado is an indulger in "the worldes new fashion." Harvey considers Greene's wit to be "nothing but a mint of knauerie." Shakespeare's Armado is a "child of Fancie," who amuses the king with prevarications and "minstrelsie;" and Harvey thinks Greene an "Artificer . . . a Gay nothing."

In *LLL* (I. i. 233-37), Armado's letter is of some interest:

So it is besedged with sable coloured melancholie, I did commend the blacke oppressing humour to the most holsome phisicke of thy health-geuing ayre: And as I am a Gentleman, betooke myselfe to walke

One recalls that Greene's *A Quip for an Vpstart Courtier* begins in much the same way:

It was iust at that time when the Cuckeulds querister beganne to bewray Aprill Gentlemen with his neuer changed notes, that I damped with a melancholy humour, went into the fields to cleare up my wittes with the fresh aire: where solitarie looking to sollace my selfe I fell in a dreame

Next, when Armado and his Page are first introduced (I. ii), Armado names him his "tender Iuvenall," a title which, in the course of the following conversation, is often repeated: "I spoke it tender iuvenal, as a congruent apethaton apperteining to thy younger dayes, which we may nominate tender." (I. ii. 14-16) Similarly, in his address "To those Gentleman, his Quondam acquaintance," Greene mentions one ". . . young Iuvenall, that biting satyrist that lastlie with mee together writ a comedie," apparently with reference to Nashe.

In *LLL* (I. ii. 44), Page describes Armado as being a "Gentleman and gamester." Greene, although of the tradesman class, was university

11. Harvey, *op cit.*, I, pp. 189-90.

12. David, *op. cit.*, fn. 189, p. 11.

trained and always wrote of himself as "gentleman." Nevertheless, Harvey delights in calling him as a "Gamester." Like Greene, Armado did not wish to associate with either the Gamester or the Tapster class.

In *LLL* (I. ii. 60-61), Armado tells his Page, "I will hereupon confesse I am in loue: and it is base for a Souldier to loue; so I am in loue with a base wench." In one instance, Harvey accuses Greene of having been a soldier whose mistress was the sister of "cutting ball," a notorious degenerate, ". . . a sorry ragged queane, of whom hee had his base sonne."¹³

In *LLL* (V. i. 10-22), the Pedant, Holofernes, describes Armado in the following manner:

His humour is loftie, his discourse peremptorie: his tongue fyled, his eye ambitious, his gate maiesticall, and his generall behauior vaine, rediculous, & thrasonical. He is too picked, to spruce, too affected, to od as it were, too peregrinat as I may call it He draweth out the thred of his verbotie, finer then the staple of his argument. I abhorre such phanatticall phantasims, such insociable and poynt deuise companions, such rakers of ortagriphie

In comparison, Harvey characterizes Greene as a man with ". . . ruffinly haire, vnseemly apparell, and more vnseemly Company; his vaine-glorious and Thrasonically braunge: his piperly Extemporizing . . . his apish counterfeiting of euerie ridiculous, and absurd toy . . ." ¹⁴ At the same time, Holofernes's remark concerning Armado's ability to draw out ". . . the thred of his verbotie, finer than the staple of his argument," seems to be echoed in Harvey's comment, ". . . the running Head, and the scribbling Hand, that neuer lynes putting forth new, newer, & newest bookes of the maker." Finally, Holofernes says that the study of orthography suggests infamy to him, and one feels certain that Greene, as one of the "very ring-leaders of the riming, scribbling crew . . . the king of the paper stage," ¹⁵ would have been recognized for his experimentation with, perhaps, "fier new wordes" fresh from his "mint of phrases." It is significant that Harvey thought of Greene as a "very prouerb of Infamy and contempt." ¹⁶

In *LLL* (V. i. 74-77), the Clowne assumes the burden of the dialogue and alludes to money and, in particular, to pennies:

And I had but one peny in the world thou shouldst haue it to buy Ginger bread: Holde, there is the verie Remuneration I had of thy Maister, thou halfepennie purse of wit, thou Pidgin-egge of discretion.

On the other hand, when Harvey parodies Nashe's title, *Pierce Pennilesse*, he writes, ". . . a better man without money than money without a man: Pennilesse is not his purse but his mind . . .," ¹⁷ later referring to his

13. Harvey, *op. cit.*, I, p. 169.

14. *Ibid.*, p. 168.

15. *Ibid.*, p. 167.

16. *Ibid.*, p. 163.

17. *Ibid.*, p. 197.

“. . . Penny-worthes of his Penniles witt.”¹⁸

Possibly one may detect a further reference to Harvey and to his share in the Marprelate controversy in *LLL* (V.ii.599-633) in the play-within-the-play episode in which the Pedant acts the role of Judas in the impromptu sketch. Here, there occurs a series of puns upon *Judas* and especially upon *elder* (previously cited). In the course of the playlet, the Pedant-Judas explains that he has been “put out of countenance,” a complaint which Harvey often made during his many quarrels with others in the period. This particular scene concludes with a comparison of the Pedant-Judas type to a *Jude-asse* and a *Lion*, and one recalls that Nashe once alluded to Harvey, saying “. . . away with the Asse in the Lions skinne.”¹⁹

The Harvey-Nashe quarrel continued until 1599. As the evidence in this investigation tends to show, Shakespeare must have been aware of the two personages involved in this feud at a time when the argument was at its pamphleteering height and attracting the most public attention. At least, one has reason to think that *LLL* contains allusions to the quarrel which, when fully understood, may eventually identify it as Shakespeare's own commentary upon such a notorious argument. With the aid of such evidence, one may date the play as 1592/93 with a greater degree of accuracy than has hitherto been possible.

18. *Ibid.*, p. 283.

19. Thomas Nashe, *The Complete Works of Thomas Nashe*, II, p. 226.

Ball Bibliography

- Chambers, Sir E. K., *The Elizabethan Stage*. In IV Vols. Oxford: at the Clarendon Press, 1923.
- Clode, Charles Mathew, *The Early History of the Guild of Merchant Taylors of the Fraternity of St. John the Baptist*. In II Vols. London: Harrison and Sons, 1888.
-, *Memorials of the Guild of Merchant Taylors of the Fraternity of St. John the Baptist, in the City of London; and of Its Associated Charities and Institutions*. London: Harrison and Sons, 1875.
- The Dictionary of National Biography*. In XXII Vols. Ed. by Sir Leslie Stephen and Sir Sidney Lee. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1882-1950.
- Grove, Sir George, *Dictionary of Music and Musicians*. Fifth Edition. Ed. by Eric Blom. London: The Macmillan Company, 1954.
- Harbage, Alfred, *Shakespeare and the Rival Traditions*. New York: The Macmillan Company, 1952.
- Herbert, William, *The History of the Twelve Great Livery Companies of London*. In II Vols. London: published by the author, 1837.
- Hillebrand, H. N., *The Child Actors*. Urbana: University of Illinois Studies in Language and Literature, by the University of Illinois Press, 1926.
-, "Sebastian Westcote, Dramatist and Master of the Children of Paul's," *Journal of English and Germanic Philology*, XIV (1915), pp. 568-584.
- Hogrefe, Pearl, *The Sir Thomas More Circle*. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1959.
- Leach, A. F., *The Schools of Medieval England*. New York: The Macmillan Company, 1915.
- Morley, Thomas, *A Plaine and Easie Introduction to Practicall Musicke*, The Shakespeare Association Facsimiles, XIV, with an introduction by Edmund H. Fellowes. Oxford: Humphrey Milford, 1937.
- Reese, Gustave, *Music in the Renaissance*. New York: W. W. Norton and Company, 1954.
- Simpson, W. Sparrow, *Documents Illustrating the History of S. Paul's Cathedral*. Westminster: Printed for the Camden Society, New Series XXVI, 1880.
- Stow, John, *A Survey of London*, reprinted from the text of 1603 with introduction and notes by Charles Lethbridge Kingsford. In II Vols. Oxford: at the Clarendon Press, 1908.

Pogue Bibliography

- Atkinson, Dorothy, "Source of *The Two Gentlemen of Verona*," *Studies in Philology*, XL (1944), pp. 223-34.
- Baldwin, Thomas W., *Shakespeare's Five-Act Structure*. Urbana: The University of Illinois Press, 1947.
- Chambers, Sir E. K., *The Elizabethan Stage*. In IV Vols. Oxford: at the Clarendon Press, 1923.
-, *William Shakespeare*. In II Vols. Oxford: at the Clarendon Press, 1930.
- Craig (ed.), Hardin, *The Complete Works of Shakespeare*. New York: Scott Foresman and Company, 1951.
- Morley, Henry, *English Writers*. In X Vols. London: Cassell and Company, Limited, 1893.
- Rolfe (ed.), W. J., *The Two Gentlemen of Verona*. New York: Harper & Brothers, 1890.
- Shakespeare, William, *The Two Gentlemen of Verona*. New York: The University Society, 1901.
- Tolman, Albert H., *Questions on Shakespeare*. In II Vols. Chicago: The University Press, 1910.
- Wilson (ed.), J. Dover, *The Two Gentlemen of Verona*. New York: The Macmillan Company, 1921.
- Wotton, Henry, *A Courtlie Controuersie of Cupids Cautels*. London: by Francis Coldock and Henry Bynnerman, 1578 (micro-filmed copy, courtesy British Museum).

Somer Bibliography

- Albright, E. M., *Dramatic Publications in England, 1580-1640*. New York: D. C. Heath and Company. 1927.
- Alexander, P., *Shakespeare's Life and Art*. London: James Nisbet and Company Limited. 1939.
- Bald, R. C. (ed.), *A Game at Chesse*. By Thomas Middleton. Cambridge: University Press. 1929.
- Baldwin, T. W., *The Organization and Personnel of the Shakespearean Company*. Princeton: University Press. 1927.
-, *Shakespeare's Five-Act Structure*. Urbana: University of Illinois Press. 1947.
- Bowers, F., *On Editing Shakespeare and the Elizabethan Dramatists*. Richmond, Virginia: William Byrd Press, Incorporated. 1955.
- Chambers, E. K., *The Elizabethan Stage*. In IV Vols. Oxford: Clarendon Press. 1923.

-, *William Shakespeare*. In II Vols. Oxford: Clarendon Press. 1930.
- Craig, H. (ed.), *The Complete Works of Shakespeare*. Chicago: Scott, Foresman and Company. 1951.
- Davis, G., "The Huntington Library," *Shakespeare Survey*, VI (1933), pp. 53-63.
- Feuillerat, A., *The Composition of Shakespeare's Plays*. New Haven: Yale University Press. 1953.
- Furness, H. H. (ed.), *A New Variorum Edition of Shakespeare: Vol. XI The Winter's Tale*. Philadelphia: J. B. Lippincott Company. 1898.
- Glover, A., and A. R. Waller (eds.), *The Works of Francis Beaumont and John Fletcher*. In X Vols. Cambridge: University Press. 1906.
- Gordon, D. J., "Shakespeare's Life and Times," *Shakespeare Survey*, II (1949), pp. 141-144.
- Graves, T. S., "Ralph Crane and the King's Players," *Studies in Philology*, XXI (April, 1924), pp. 362-66.
- Greg, W. W., *Dramatic Documents from the Elizabethan Playhouse*. Oxford: Clarendon Press. 1931.
-, *The Editorial Problem in Shakespeare*. Oxford: Clarendon Press. 1942.
- (ed.), *Henslowe's Diary*. In II Vols. London: A. H. Dullin. 1904.
-, "Prompt Copies, Private Transcripts, and the 'Playhouse Scrivener'," *The Library*, VI, 4 (September, 1926), pp. 148-56.
-, *The Shakespeare First Folio*. Oxford: Clarendon Press. 1955.
-, "Some Notes on Crane's Manuscript of *The Witch*," *The Library*, XXII, 4 (March, 1942), pp. 208-22.
- Herford, C. H., and Percy and Evelyn Simpson (eds.), *Ben Jonson*. In XI Vols. Oxford: Clarendon Press. 1950.
-, *Facsimile of the First Folio Edition of Shakespeare's Plays, (1623)*. Oxford: Clarendon Press. 1902.
-, *A Life of William Shakespeare*. New York: Macmillan. 1916.
- McManaway, J. G., "Textual Studies," *Shakespeare Survey*, II (1949), pp. 145-153.
- Parsons, H., *Shakespearian Emendations and Discoveries*. London: Etrick Press Limited. 1953.
- Partridge, A. C., "Shakespeare's Orthography in *Venus and Adonis* and some Early Quartos," *Shakespeare Survey*, VII (1954), pp. 35-47.
- Rolfe, W. F. (ed.), *Shakespeare's Comedy of the Winter's Tale*. New York: American Book Company. 1898.
- Shakespeare, William, *Mr. William Shakespeare's Comedies, Histories, & Tragedies*. A facsimile edition prepared by Helge Kökeritz and Charles Tyler Prouty. New Haven: Yale University Press. 1954.

- Shroeder, J. W., *The Great Folio of 1623: Shakespeare's Plays in the Printing House*. Northwestern University: The Shoe String Press. 1956.
- Tannenbaum, S. A., *Shakespearian Scraps and other Elizabethan Fragments*. New York: Columbia University Press. 1933.
- Thompson, E. M., *Shakespeare's Handwriting*. Oxford: Clarendon Press. 1916.
- Walker, A., *Textual Problems of the First Folio*. Cambridge: University Press. 1916.
- Willoughby, E. E., *The Printing of the First Folio of Shakespeare*. London: Oxford University Press for the Bibliographical Society. 1932.
- Wilson, F. P., "Ralph Crane, Scrivener to the King's Players," *The Library*, VII, 4 (September, 1926), pp. 194-215.
-, "Some Notes on Authors and Patrons in Tudor and Stuart Times," *John Quincy Adams: Memorial Studies*. Washington: The Folger Shakespeare Library. 1948.
- Wilson, J. D., "The New Way with Shakespeare's Texts: An Introduction for Lay Readers. I. The Foundations," *Shakespeare Survey*, VII (1954), pp. 48-56.
-, "The Way with Shakespeare's Texts: An Introduction for Lay Readers. III. In Sight of Shakespeare's Manuscripts," *Shakespeare Survey*, IX (1924), pp. 69-80.
- (ed.), *The Winter's Tale. By William Shakespeare*. London: Faber and Okyer Limited. n. d.

Kettner Bibliography

- Greene, Robert, *Ciceronis Amor: Tullies Love (1589) and A Quip for an Vpstart Courtier (1592)*. Scholars' Facsimiles and Reprints. Gainesville, Florida: Wayside Press, 1954.
- Halliwell-Phillipps, J. O., *Outlines of the Life of Shakespeare*. Fourth edition. London: Longmans, Green, and Company, 1884.
- Harvey, Gabriel, *The Works of Gabriel Harvey*. In III Vols. Ed. by Alexander B. Grossart. London: Hazell, Watson, & Viney, Limited, 1884, 1885.
- McGinn, D. J., "The Precise Angelo," *Joseph Quincy Adams Memorial Studies*. Brattleboro, Vermont: E. L. Hildreth & Company, 1948.
- Nashe, Thomas, *The Complete Works of Thomas Nashe*. In VI Vols. Ed. by A. B. Grossart. London: Hazell, Watson, and Viney, 1884-85.
- Partridge, Eric, *Shakespeare's Bawdy*. New York: E. P. Dutton and Company, Inc., 1960.
- Shakespeare, William, *Love's Labour's Lost*. Ed. by Richard David. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1951.

-, *Shakspeare's Loves Labours Lost: The First Quarto, 1598, A Facsimile in Photo-Lithography*. Ed. by Frederick J. Furnivall. London: W. Griggs, n.d.
-, *A New Variorum Edition of Shakespeare, Loue's Labour's Lost*. Second edition. Ed. by H. H. Furness. Philadelphia: J. B. Lippincott Company, 1906.

The Emporia State Research Studies

- Vol. I, No. 1, 1952: Willis Ratzlaff, *The Limnology of Some Roadside Ditches in Chase and Lyon Counties, Kansas*. No. 2,* 1952: C. Stewart Boertman, *Apportionment in the Kansas House of Representatives*. No. 3,* 1953: John Breukelman and Ted F. Andrews, *Offerings and Enrollments in Secondary School Sciences in Kansas in 1951-52*. No. 4, 1953: George S. Blair, *The Office of County Coroner in Kansas*.
- Vol. II, No. 1, 1953: Green D. Wyrick, *The World of Ernest Hemingway*. No. 2,* 1953: Ira Everett Welch, *The Comparison of Column Method Versus the Context Method in the Teaching of Spelling*. No. 3, 1954: Jerry P. Leibman, *Press Freedom and Libel as Defined by Kansas Case Law*. No. 4, 1954: Harold Crimmins, *A History of The Kansas Central Railway, 1871-1935*.
- Vol. III, No. 1, 1954: Fred W. Grabhorn, *Status of Teachers of Business Subjects in the Secondary Schools of Kansas, 1953-1954*; Billy Lee Fowler, *Turnover of Business Teachers in the Secondary Schools in Kansas, 1952-1953*; Eleanor Patrick Evans, *List of Free Teaching Aids for Typewriting, Bookkeeping, and Shorthand*. No. 2, 1954: Garrett R. Carpenter, *Silksville: A Kansas Attempt in the History of Fourierist Utopias, 1869-1892*. No. 3, 1955: John C. Scafe, *Foreign Language Teaching in Kansas High Schools, 1953-1954*. No. 4, 1955: Richard A. Valyer, *A Proposed Course of Study for Driver Education*.
- Vol. IV, No. 1, 1955: Jessie Louise Losey, *A Selected, Annotated List of One-Act Plays for Festival Use*. No. 2, 1955: George E. Thornton, *The Social and Moral Philosophy of Thomas Dekker*. No. 3, 1956: John Breukelman and Ted F. Andrews, *Offerings and Enrollments in Secondary School Sciences in Kansas in 1954-1955*. No. 4, 1956: S. Hull Sisson and Harry Walthall, *An Annotated Bibliography of Theses Accepted for the Master of Science Degree, Kansas State Teachers College, Emporia, 1945 Through 1954*.
- Vol. V, No. 1,* 1956: Walt Butcher, *Presidential Election Returns for Kansas, 1864-1952*. No. 2,* 1956: Alex A. Daughtry, *A Report on the Post-Graduation Activities of the 1955 Kansas High School Graduates*. No. 3, 1957: Carl W. Prophet, *Seasonal Variations and Abundance of Cladocera and Copepoda and Some Physical-Chemical Conditions of the Fall and Verdigris Rivers in Wilson and Montgomery Counties, Kansas*; Claire L. Schelske, *An Ecological Study of the Fishes of the Fall and Verdigris Rivers in Wilson and Montgomery Counties, Kansas*. No. 4, 1957: William C. Tremmel, *The Social Concepts of George Herbert Mead*.
- Vol. VI, No. 1, 1957: John M. Matthews, *Sang De Boeuf: Its Chinese Historical References and Local Reduction Experiments in Electric Firing Kilns*. No. 2, 1957: Weldon N. Baker and Merle E. Brooks, *Background and Academic Preparation of the Teachers of Science in the High Schools of Kansas 1955-1956*. No. 3,* 1958: Harold V. Sare, *Nehru and the Rise of the Modern State of India*. No. 4,* 1958: Robert M. Taylor, *Acoustics for the Singer*.
- Vol. VII, No. 1, 1958: Robert F. Clarke, *An Ecological Study of Reptiles and Amphibians in Osage County, Kansas*. No. 2, 1958: Harold V. Sare and Wallace Browning, *Background and Academic Preparation of the Social Science Teachers in the High Schools of Kansas 1956-1957*. No. 3, 1959: John M. Burger, *Background and Academic Preparation of the Mathematics Teachers in the Public High Schools of Kansas 1957-1958*. No. 4, 1959: Johnny L. Kloefkorn, *A Critical Study of the Work of H. L. Mencken as Literary Editor and Critic on the American Mercury*.
- Vol. VIII, No.1, 1959: Herman H. Harris, Jr., *The History and Calculation of Pi*. No. 2, 1959: Willard O. Stibal, *The Historical Development of Student Personnel Records in Colleges and Universities*. No. 3, 1960: Donald E. Zimmerman, *The Nature of Man: John Donne's Songs and Holy Sonnets*. No. 4, 1960: Emily L. Hartman, *The F. B. and Rena G. Ross Natural History Reservation*.
- Vol. IX, No. 1, 1960: Charles E. Walton, *To Maske in Myrthe: Spenser's Theatrical Practices in The Faerie Queene*. No. 2, 1960: Paul G. Jantzen, *The Ecology of a Boggy Marsh in Stafford County, Kansas*. No. 3,* 1961: R. Alton Lee, *Pasquale Paoli: Fighter for Freedom*. No. 4, 1961: Eugene Donald Decker, *A Selected Annotated Bibliography of Sources in the Kansas State Historical Society Pertaining to Kansas in the Civil War*.
- Vol. X, No. 1, 1961: John Breukelman and Ralph P. Frazier, *Offerings and Enrollments in the Secondary School Sciences in Kansas in 1960-1961*. No. 2, 1961, Marvin Ewy, *Charles Curtis Kansas: Vice President of the United States, 1929-1933*. No. 3, 1962, J. J. Weigand, *A Comparison of the Effectiveness of Two Methods of Teaching General Music in the Junior High School*. No. 4, 1962, Roma Ball and Others, *Four Studies in Elizabethan Drama*.

*This issue is no longer available.